

MEMORANDUM

To: Eric Grimm – CORE Spaces

From: Rory Fancler, AICP, PTP – Kimley-Horn
Tim Sjogren, P.E., PTOE – Kimley-Horn

Date: October 20, 2017

RE: Parking Demand Summary for The Hub at East Lansing

On behalf of CORE Spaces, Kimley-Horn of Michigan, Inc. (Kimley-Horn) evaluated the parking demand for The Hub at East Lansing, a mixed-use development proposed on the south side of East Grand River Avenue between Bogue Street and Cedar Street, commonly known as 918 and 1010 East Grand River Avenue, in East Lansing, Michigan. The proposed development includes approximately 10,226 square feet of ground floor retail, 1,994 square feet of ground floor restaurant, and 347 apartment units. The apartment units would be targeted to Michigan State University (MSU) students. As part of the project, a total of 158 parking spaces would be provided in a parking deck, including 27 public spaces for the retail use and 131 spaces for the residential units. In addition, dedicated spaces for moped scooter parking would be provided within the parking deck. Access to the parking deck would be provided via a right-in/right-out driveway to Bogue Street and a full-access driveway to Cedar Street, as well as a driveway to the public alley located along the southern boundary of the site.

The parking demand was evaluated relative to the City of East Lansing requirements and the parking characteristics of similar developments completed by CORE Spaces in markets similar to East Lansing. This memorandum presents a review of the proposed parking supply and summarizes key findings and conclusions.

Project Location

The subject site is located on the south side of East Grand River Avenue between Bogue Street and Cedar Street. Located immediately east of the MSU campus, the subject property is within the East Village District.

Consistent with the requirements of the East Village District, the proposed development would enhance pedestrian connectivity with sidewalk along three sides of the building. The sidewalk would connect to the existing striped crosswalk on Bogue Street, providing for pedestrian access to MSU. Connectivity to the existing striped crosswalk on Cedar Street would also encourage pedestrian access to the existing commercial uses along East Grand River Avenue. In addition, bicycle parking is proposed onsite consistent with the City of East Lansing requirements.

Capital Area Transportation Authority (CATA) provides service along East Grand River Avenue and Bogue Street as described on the following page.

- **Route 01:** Operates daily fixed-route service between Downtown Lansing to the west of the subject site and Meridian Mall to the east. Near the project site, service is provided along East Grand River Avenue with the eastbound transit stop located in front of the subject property (Stop #1694), immediately east of Bogue Street. Route 01 westbound stops on the north side East Grand Avenue between Gunnson Street and Cedar Street (Stop #1723); an additional stop is provided west of Kedzie Street (Stop #1724). To access the westbound stops, a pedestrian crossing is provided on the east leg of East Grand River Avenue at its intersection with Bogue Street.
- **Route 20:** Provides daily north-south fixed-route service between MSU and the intersection of Beau Jardin Drive/Dunckel Road. Near the subject site, Route 20 travels southbound on Bogue Street to Shaw Lane. A stop is provided on Bogue Street immediately south of East Grand River Avenue (Stop #4645), across the street from the subject site. A striped crosswalk is provided on Bogue Street at its intersection with East Grand River Avenue; therefore, pedestrian connectivity is provided between the transit stop and the subject site.
- **Route 23:** Provides weekday fixed-route service between MSU and the Okemos and Haslett communities to the east and northeast, respectively. Near the subject site, Route 23 travels westbound on East Grand River with the nearest stop provided on the north side of the street west of Stoddard Avenue (Stop #1722).

In addition to these routes, CATA operates five fixed routes on campus on weekdays and three fixed routes on campus on weekends.

City of East Lansing Parking Requirements

Off-street parking requirements for The Hub at East Lansing are defined in Section 50-812 (Required parking ratios) of the City of East Lansing Code of Ordinances. According to the Code, mixed-use developments shall provide the sum of the individual requirements for each use except for the following conditions:

- In the B2 and B3 districts, where the mixed-use includes a residential use, the parking required for the residential component is reduced by 50 percent.
- In all zoning districts, where the individual uses are expected to experience peak parking demands at different times, where the individual uses serve complementary functions, or where special circumstances (e.g., type of uses, proximity to transit, proximity to public parking) demonstrate parking demand of the building will be met with less parking than otherwise required.

Parking Reduction

Pursuant to Section 50-814(6) of the Code, reduced parking should be considered for the proposed mixed-use development due to its connectivity to the MSU campus, proximity to transit, availability of other alternate transportation modes, and anticipated parking demand. The subject property is located within the East Village District, which was identified as a key development tool in *The East Village Master Plan* (adopted February 8, 2006). The intent of the East Village Form-Based Zoning Code is to “maximize the economic, social, and environmental benefits” of the defined area. As emphasized in *The East Village Master Plan*, one of the goals for this area is “to create a unique, high-density, mixed-use land use pattern”. The purpose and intent of the zoning district, and the character of (re)development within the East Village District is similar to that defined for the B3 District (City Center Commercial District) as outlined on the following page.

“to provide for a wide range of commercial and high density residential land uses. Because of its proximity to the Michigan State University campus and nearby residential neighborhoods, a major characteristic of the City Center is its intense core of pedestrian activity . . . [which] helps to create a unique social environment . . .”

As noted above, the B3 District acknowledges its proximity to the MSU campus and highlights pedestrian activity within the area. Similarly, *The East Village Master Plan* acknowledges the role of pedestrian and bicycle activity and anticipates improvements in the East Village area to improve non-motorized connections to the MSU campus. While *The East Village Master Plan* recommended creation of the East Village District in order to provide the zoning tools to allow for an urban mixed-use style of development, the zoning code does not provide parking requirements which support these types of uses. Specifically, the code requirements for the East Village District do not include the automatic parking reductions offered for similar properties in the B2 and B3 Districts. The subject development is consistent with not only the type of development contemplated in *The East Village Master Plan* but also the purpose and intent of the B3 District; therefore, the 50 percent residential parking reduction applied to mixed-use developments in the B2 and B3 Districts, as defined by Section 50-814(6)(a)(2) of the Code, should be considered for the subject site.

According to the Code, a 50 percent reduction to Code-required parking may be applied to the residential component of a mixed-use development in the B3 District. The Code also provides a different parking ratio for “Other nonresidential uses” in the B3 District. **Table 1** provides a summary of the adjusted parking requirements for The Hub at East Lansing using the parking ratios defined for the B3 District.

As shown in the table, a 30 percent non-motorized transportation reduction was applied to the parking required for the nonresidential uses (i.e., retail and restaurant uses). According to data provided in the *City of East Lansing Non-motorized Transportation Plan* (dated May 11, 2011), the City has over twice the national average of walking and biking trips. Approximately 30 percent of commute trips are completed by alternate modes (i.e., bike, walk or public transit) with the highest percentage completed by walking. Based on the subject property’s proximity to MSU and the existing non-motorized transportation network, it is anticipated that at least 30 percent of the retail and restaurant trips will be non-motorized (e.g., bike, walk or public transit). Based on the site’s proximity to campus and convenient access transit, actual use of alternate transportation modes may be higher than 30 percent.

Table 1. Parking Requirements

The Hub at East Lansing		East Lansing Code of Ordinances	
Land Use / Unit Type	Total Units	Parking Ratio	Total Required Parking
Class A Multiple-Family			
Efficiency Unit	191 ¹	0.75 space / unit	144
1-Bedroom Unit	--	1 space / unit	--
2-Bedroom Unit	91	1.5 space / unit	137
3-Bedroom Unit	65 ²	2.5 spaces / unit	163
4-Bedroom Unit	--	3.5 spaces / unit	--
+ 4-Bedroom Unit	--	1 space / bedroom > 4	--
Subtotal (Residential)	347 units	Parking Requirement	444 spaces
			<i>50% Residential Parking Reduction</i>
			-222 spaces
			Adjusted Parking Requirement
			222 spaces
			Parking Provided
			131 spaces (residential)
Retail	10,226 sq. ft.	1 space / 500 sq. ft. ³	21 spaces
Restaurant	1,994 sq. ft.	1 space / 50 sq. ft. ⁴	40 spaces
Subtotal (Retail/Restaurant)	12,220 sq. ft.	Parking Requirement	61 spaces
			<i>30% Non-Motorized Transportation Reduction</i>
			-18 spaces
			Adjusted Parking Requirement
			43 spaces
			Parking Provided
			27 spaces (public)
			Total Parking Requirement
			518 spaces
			Adjusted Total Parking Requirement
			265 spaces
			Total Parking Provided
			158 spaces
			27 retail spaces
			131 residential spaces

¹Includes studio and micro units.

²For purposes of a conservative analysis, includes 35 2-bedroom units with three beds and 30 traditional 3-bedroom units.

³ Per City of East Lansing Code of Ordinances, "Other nonresidential uses" outside the B3 District shall provide parking at a ratio of 1 space per 300 square feet of gross floor area. Within the B3 District, parking shall be provided at a ratio of 1 space per 500 square feet. Based on the density and mixed-use character of the East Village District, proximity of the subject property to the MSU campus and use of alternate transportation modes, the B3 District parking ratio was applied.

⁴Per City of East Lansing Code of Ordinances, restaurant uses are required to provide parking at a ratio of 1 space per 50 square feet in dining room and lounge area plus 1 space per each 20 square feet of customer waiting area if takeout service is provided.

Using the adjusted parking requirements for The Hub at East Lansing, a total of 265 spaces would be required for the proposed development. The proposed 158-space parking deck would result in a parking deficit of 107 spaces. A total of 16 of these spaces are required for the retail and restaurant uses, and the remaining 91 spaces are required for the residential use. The proposed moped scooter parking may influence use of alternative transportation modes and further reduce parking demand for the retail, restaurant, and residential uses. It is also important to note that the parking supply proposed for the residential use would be managed through the lease terms. As currently proposed, The Hub at East Lansing would be able to offer permit parking for up to 131 spaces; additional parking would not be available.

Although the subject site is zoned East Village District, there is no compelling difference between the character of development and reliance on non-motorized transportation within the area immediately surrounding the subject site as compared to parcels within the B3 District. Therefore, the 50 percent residential parking reduction applied to mixed-use developments in the B2 and B3 Districts, as defined in Section 50-814(6)(a)(2) of the Code, should be considered for the proposed mixed-use development. Furthermore, based on the size of the retail tenant spaces and the character of the existing commercial uses within the study area, the anticipated vehicle trips and parking demand for the ground-floor retail and restaurant uses is expected to be reduced by at least 30 percent as a result of the transportation mode split characteristics of East Lansing. Parking demand may also be further reduced by the symbiotic relationship between the ground floor commercial uses and upper level residential use.

Empirical Parking Demand

CORE Spaces compiled data of parking provided for comparable mixed-use developments. A summary of the empirical parking supply and demand data for these mixed-use developments is summarized in **Table 2** below.

Table 2. Summary of CORE Spaces Empirical Parking Data

CORE Spaces Mixed-Use Developments				Residential Parking		Retail Parking	
Location	Total Units	Total Beds	Retail (sq. ft.)	Supply	Supply Ratio (spaces / bed)	Supply	Supply Ratio (spaces / 1,000 sq. ft.)
Michigan State University							
The Hub (Proposed)	347	568	12,220	131	0.25	27	2.2
University of Wisconsin-Madison							
The Hub	313	961	26,080	160	0.17	5	0.19
The James	367	850	8,740	144	0.17	--	--
University of Arizona							
Level, Luna	176	586	--	93	0.16	--	--
Next, Sol	165	389	10,900	90	0.23	--	--
The Hub	164	594	10,000	98	0.16	--	--
The Hub 2	104	311	--	65	0.21	--	--
University of Michigan							
Landmark	173	606	8,655	134	0.22	8	0.92
University of Oregon							
The Hub	183	513	2,100	68	0.13	--	--

As shown in the table, a number of existing CORE Spaces mixed-use developments provide parking ratios below that proposed for The Hub at East Lansing. For many of these sites, dedicated retail parking is not provided. Where onsite parking is provided, it is limited due to the density and mixed-use character of the surrounding area and use of alternate transportation modes.

Based on review of the development density, geographic location, and university student enrollment and demographics for each of the sites listed in Table 2, The James and The Hub near the University of Wisconsin-Madison are most similar to The Hub at East Lansing. A summary of the university student

enrollment and demographics for the University of Wisconsin-Madison as compared to MSU is provided as **Attachment 1**.

The Hub and The James near the University of Wisconsin-Madison each provide residential parking at a ratio of 0.17 per bed, which is less than the residential parking ratio proposed for The Hub at East Lansing (0.25 spaces per bed). As of October 2017, only 55 percent (89 spaces) of the parking spaces at The Hub at University of Wisconsin-Madison are leased even though the building is 83 percent occupied (798 beds). At The James, while the building is fully occupied (850 beds) only 65 percent (94 spaces) are leased. This empirical parking demand data suggests the parking ratio of 0.25 spaces per bed would support demand characteristics observed at two existing CORE Spaces mixed-use developments located near the University of Wisconsin-Madison. It should be noted that while The Hub and The James are within walking distance from the University of Wisconsin-Madison, they are not immediately across the street from the university, as is the case with The Hub at East Lansing and MSU. The Hub at East Lansing's proximity to MSU may reduce car ownership or parking demand as compared to the two existing CORE Spaces mixed-use developments at University of Wisconsin-Madison.

As part of management of The Hub at East Lansing, CORE Spaces would provide up to 131 residential parking permits, consistent with the proposed parking supply. The parking permits are incorporated into the lease terms; a parking permit is not available to all tenants. In the event a tenant is interested in alternate parking, an on-campus parking permit could be obtained from MSU. While students residing in residence halls are subject to eligibility requirements to obtain a parking permit, students residing off campus may register a vehicle regardless of their credit status.

Summary

Per Section 50-814(6) of the Code, the City of East Lansing may consider reduced parking for specific uses or other circumstances which influence parking demand such as proximity to transit. Based on empirical parking data from other similar mixed-use developments, combined with the location of the subject property relative to the MSU campus and existing transit service, reduced parking should be considered for the proposed mixed-use development. Consistent with the purpose and intent of the B3 District, the East Village District and the proposed mixed-use development, provide connectivity to the MSU campus, support use of alternate transportation modes, and contribute to the urban mixed-use character of the area. These characteristics, combined with the size of the retail tenant spaces, are also expected to reduce parking demand for the ground-floor retail and restaurant uses.

Although a review of the City of East Lansing Code of Ordinances demonstrates that there is a parking deficit of approximately 107 spaces, the empirical data provided for similar CORE Spaces mixed-use developments supports the proposed parking supply. The proposed parking supply reflects the unique nature of the development site and surrounding built environment. The site's proximity and connectivity to MSU, combined with the CATA stops located within a five-minute walk from the subject site, is expected to influence resident and guest parking demand characteristics.

University	University of Wisconsin-Madison	Michigan State University
Enrollment & Demographics		
Total Enrollment	43,489	50,344
Total Undergraduate Enrollment	31,662	39,090
Total Graduate Enrollment	11,727	11,254
Total Full-time Enrollment	38,344	43,528
Full-Time Undergrad	28,569	35,280
Full-Time Graduate	9,775	8,248
Total First Time / Full Time Freshmen	6,259	8,005
International	2,329	5,013
% Out-of-state Undergrad (excluding international)	33%	14%
Out-of-state Enrollment (Undergrad)	9,680	4,771
Target Market (International + Out-of-state + Grad)	23,736	21,038
University Metrics		
1 Yr Retention Rate	96%	92%
6 Yr Graduation Rate	85%	77%
On-Campus Market		
On Campus Beds	7,488	17,200
As % of total enrollment	17%	34%
Off-Campus Market		
Total Purpose-Built Beds	18,147	7,930
As % of total enrollment	42%	16%
Occupancy Rate	97%	98%
On- and Off-Campus Beds	25,635	25,130
As % of total enrollment	59%	50%